

TYPO3.Fluid - Bug # 37387

Status:	Resolved	Priority:	Must have
Author:	Krzysztof Daniel	Category:	ViewHelpers
Created:	2012-05-22	Assigned To:	Karsten Dambekalns
Updated:	2012-07-18	Due date:	
Has patch:	No		
Affected Flow version:	FLOW3 1.1.0 beta 1		
Subject:	Translate Helper: Arguments replacement is not working for default value		
Description	<p>I have following tag and there is no translation in xliiff file yet for key 'something'</p> <pre><f:translate id="something" arguments="{0: 'test'}">You haven't created a {0}, yet</f:translate></pre> <p>Expected behavior would be that it will output: You haven't created a test, yet</p> <p>But argument replacement is not working for default message and output is now: You haven't created a , yet</p>		

Associated revisions

Revision 96189df3 - 2012-07-10 16:19 - Karsten Dambekalns

[BUGFIX] Replace placeholders in fallback for id translation

When using id based translation and no translation is defined in XLIFF, the tag value is used as a fallback in TranslateViewHelper.

With this change, the fallback is passed to label based translation, making placeholder replacement work also if no translation does exist yet.

Change-Id: If812e7ae968a247e7f1a075f1eb0f7ff97982eab

Fixes: #37387

Releases: 1.1, 1.2

Revision a4a939cb - 2012-07-18 12:35 - Karsten Dambekalns

[BUGFIX] Replace placeholders in fallback for id translation

When using id based translation and no translation is defined in XLIFF, the tag value is used as a fallback in TranslateViewHelper.

With this change, the fallback is passed to label based translation, making placeholder replacement work also if no translation does exist yet.

Change-Id: If812e7ae968a247e7f1a075f1eb0f7ff97982eab

Fixes: #37387

History

#1 - 2012-05-24 09:45 - Karsten Dambekalns

- Status changed from New to Accepted
- Assigned To set to Karsten Dambekalns
- Target version set to 1.1 beta 2

#2 - 2012-05-25 14:57 - Karsten Dambekalns

- Status changed from Accepted to Needs Feedback
- Target version changed from 1.1 beta 2 to 1.1

Right, but the fact that there is output is rather due to the fact that the VH itself does:

```
$originalLabel = $value === NULL ? $this->renderChildren() : $value;
...
$translation = $this->translator->translateById($id, $arguments, $quantity, $localeObject, $source, $package);
if ($translation === $id) {
    return $originalLabel;
} else {
    ...
}
```

So this is not really a "default value" but more a fallback - and doing placeholder resolving is anything but trivial (see `FormatResolver->resolvePlaceholders`).

#3 - 2012-06-25 23:00 - Krzysztof Daniel

So what do you suggest? That this "translation by label" that shall be supported same way as by key and in my opinion even if label is not in translation files yet, placeholders shall be replaced.

#4 - 2012-07-09 10:00 - Krzysztof Daniel

Any update on this?

#5 - 2012-07-09 10:37 - Bastian Waidelich

Krzysztof Daniel wrote:

```
I have following tag and there is no translation in xliif file yet for key 'something'

<f:translate id="something" arguments="{0: 'test'}">You haven't created a {0}, yet</f:translate>

Expected behavior would be that it will output:
You haven't created a test, yet
```

Do you have a valid use case for this? Why not just type

```
1<f:translate id="something" arguments="{0: 'test'}">You haven't created a test, yet</f:translate>
```

?

#6 - 2012-07-09 10:56 - Krzysztof Daniel

Because the value comes from variable.

```
<f:translate id="something" arguments="{0: '{username}'}">Hello {0}</f:translate>
```

I could do something like

```
<f:translate arguments="{0: '{username}'}">Hello {username}</f:translate>
```

But then translation by label would not work properly.

#7 - 2012-07-09 11:14 - Bastian Waidelich

Krzysztof Daniel wrote:

```
<f:translate arguments="{0: '{username}'}">Hello {username}</f:translate>  
But then translation by label would not work properly.
```

I see, that makes sense. In that case it should work though (not specifying the id argument) - did you test it?

#8 - 2012-07-09 11:38 - Krzysztof Daniel

But those are workarounds. Expected behavior shall be unified.

And if you look into real life example:

```
<f:translate id="notification.sender_and_date" arguments="{0: '{notification.sender}', 1: '{notification.createdAt -> f:format.date(format:'d-m-Y H:i')}'}">{notification.sender} {notification.createdAt -> f:format.date(format:'d-m-Y H:i')}</f:translate>
```

Execution of those helper multiple times is reaaaaaaly bad.

To make it work properly I expect that:

```
<f:translate arguments="{0: '{username}'}">Hello {0}</f:translate>
```

shall work and I can then use helpers in one place only etc.

Also our customer is extracting f:translate tags automatically to xliif files. And then they are translating it like:

```
<source>Hello {username}</source>  
<target>Czesc {username}</target>
```

And in this case the variable replacing is not working anymore. And then the arguments array makes no sense. And it is hard to explain to customer / translator to replace {whatever} to {0} and {1} and {2}... in proper order only in xdiff files.

#9 - 2012-07-10 16:07 - Karsten Dambekalns

- Status changed from Needs Feedback to Accepted

Krzysztof Daniel wrote:

| Also our customer is extracting f:translate tags automatically to xdiff files. And then they are translating it like:

Your provide the tool used and I'll fix this issue. Deal? ;)

#10 - 2012-07-10 16:22 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Accepted to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <http://review.typo3.org/12743>

#11 - 2012-07-18 12:35 - Karsten Dambekalns

- Status changed from Under Review to Resolved

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset commit:96189df3951e77ed115c33d4a12603e0571c3f7a.

#12 - 2012-07-18 12:35 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Resolved to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **FLOW3-1.1** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <http://review.typo3.org/12869>

#13 - 2012-07-18 12:35 - Karsten Dambekalns

- Status changed from Under Review to Resolved

- Target version changed from 1.1 to 1.1 RC2