

Core - Bug # 42084

Status:	Resolved	Priority:	Must have
Author:	Daniel Alder	Category:	
Created:	2012-10-17	Assigned To:	
Updated:	2013-03-04	Due date:	
TYPO3 Version:	4.6		
PHP Version:			
Complexity:			
Is Regression:			
Sprint Focus:			
Subject:	Translation 'en' missing		
Description			
<p>Since Typo3 4.6 (to 6.0) this line breaks the translation handling:</p> <p>t3lib\l10n\class.t3lib_l10n_factory.php #90</p> <p>This is completely wrong 'cause you're never able to translate an english label again.</p> <p>In theory the 'default' label is not a 'translation'. It's just a placeholder who's telling the translator what the label is standing for (in english of course). But the 'real' english translation should be in the 'en' translation.</p> <p>So in fact the 'en' translation in l10n will not be parsed.</p>			

Associated revisions

Revision b48bfc9c - 2013-02-14 15:15 - Daniel Alder

[BUGFIX] Allow "en" as language key

Fix a bug which was introduced by #25397 (commit:cb390c79).

If the selected language key is "en", do not override it to "default".

This allows custom updates to translations even for the English language.

Change-Id: I3fcbd35f0144a0cc152acd45d0861d153cc8b495

Resolves: #42084

Related: #25397

Releases: 4.6, 4.7, 6.0, 6.1

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/17414>

Reviewed-by: Oliver Hader

Tested-by: Oliver Hader

Reviewed-by: Xavier Perseguers

Tested-by: Xavier Perseguers

Revision 8df3441a - 2013-02-14 15:22 - Daniel Alder

[BUGFIX] Allow "en" as language key

Fix a bug which was introduced by #25397 (commit:cb390c79).

If the selected language key is "en", do not override it to "default".

This allows custom updates to translations even for the English language.

Change-Id: I3fcbd35f0144a0cc152acd45d0861d153cc8b495

Resolves: #42084

Related: #25397

Releases: 4.6, 4.7, 6.0, 6.1

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/17414>

Reviewed-by: Oliver Hader

Tested-by: Oliver Hader

Reviewed-by: Xavier Perseguers

Tested-by: Xavier Perseguers

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/18262>

Revision 915bf762 - 2013-02-14 15:38 - Xavier Perseguers

[BUGFIX] Allow "en" as language key

Fix a bug which was introduced by #25397 (commit:cb390c79).

If the selected language key is "en", do not override it to "default".

This allows custom updates to translations even for the English language.

Change-Id: I3fcbd35f0144a0cc152acd45d0861d153cc8b495

Resolves: #42084

Related: #25397

Releases: 4.6, 4.7, 6.0, 6.1

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/18263>

Reviewed-by: Xavier Perseguers

Tested-by: Xavier Perseguers

Revision 2c4bffaa - 2013-02-14 15:38 - Xavier Perseguers

[BUGFIX] Allow "en" as language key

Fix a bug which was introduced by #25397 (commit:cb390c79).

If the selected language key is "en", do not override it to "default".

This allows custom updates to translations even for the English language.

Change-Id: I3fcbd35f0144a0cc152acd45d0861d153cc8b495

Resolves: #42084

Related: #25397

Releases: 4.6, 4.7, 6.0, 6.1

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/18264>

Reviewed-by: Xavier Perseguers

Tested-by: Xavier Perseguers

History

#1 - 2012-10-17 22:32 - Xavier Perseguers

- Status changed from New to Needs Feedback

Please describe your use case and tell us why if something is wrong in English we should not change the "placeholder" instead of creating a "real" English translation.

#2 - 2012-10-18 08:44 - Daniel Alder

Xavier Perseguers wrote:

Please describe your use case and tell us why if something is wrong in English we should not change the "placeholder" instead of creating a "real" English translation.

For example:

the "default" label in the extension is "label1" and its text "text1"

the only way to change the label "label1" to "text2" is using TS (what's a bad practise) or change the label within the extension localizing itself in the "default" section.

reason: the l10n folder is not working anymore for "en" because it will always set to "default". On the other hand "default" is not supported in l10n.

So l10n is totally meaningless for "en" and that fools you in following situations:

- extension is from the community (translations will be overwritten on every update)
- if the extension is under version control you have to commit source 'cause of language changes to keep source up-to-date

Or am I missing some kind of alternative to change labels independently from the extensions source?

Besides:

the translation handling should be simplified/unified/extended. Is there already a discussion running?

#3 - 2012-11-04 21:24 - Xavier Perseguers

Your description makes sense. Could you come up with a patch to remove this line 90. We should test it and make sure existing unit tests still work as before, and most probably write a few new ones to check the "new" behaviour.

Make sure to think about this way as well:

<http://xavier.perseguers.ch/en/tutorials/typo3/articles/managing-localization-files.html>

#4 - 2013-01-08 11:58 - Daniel Alder

Ok thanks here it is:

<https://review.typo3.org/17414>

#5 - 2013-01-09 14:56 - Dmitry Dulepov

plugin.tx_whatever._LOCAL_LANG.default.my_label = Hello, world!

#6 - 2013-01-09 14:57 - Dmitry Dulepov

Needs tests with l10mltranslate and translation server.

#7 - 2013-01-09 16:15 - Daniel Alder

in theory "_LOCAL_LANG.default" works as expected:

it's a fault of the concept 'cause it's overwriting the `$this->LOCAL_LANG['default']`. So if you don't use an l10n 'en' file labels will be outputted from TS. But if you are using a l10n 'en' entry the 'en' is the primary key, not 'default' (see `$GLOBALS['TSFE']->config['config']['language']`). So not the `"_LOCAL_LANG.default"` label will be shown but the l10n.

but please visit:

http://wiki.typo3.org/TypoScript_language_additions_override

It's wrong with or without my patch: `[language:default|de|en|...]`

Without the patch just 'default' is working not 'en'

With my patch 'en' is working, 'default' not.

So tell me what's correct? And if both 'default' & 'en' should work. Which one is preferred?

I am coming up with a patch if the question will be answered.

The problem is located in the `"pi_loadLL"` function.

...something tells me, that the typo3 community has no unit how the translation handling should work. documentation, logic, code and people, everything is full of contradiction.

wouldn't it be better to start with overthinking the whole translation handling?

#8 - 2013-01-09 16:22 - Daniel Alder

...don't take it personally but:

lxmltranslate is not part of the core.

nobody showed consideration for snowbabel, since this issue breaks it completely.

#9 - 2013-01-10 08:18 - Dmitry Dulepov

Yes, lxmltranslate is not a part of the core but it is the official translation tool for the older versions. So we have to check. And translation server must still work properly with these changes.

#10 - 2013-02-06 18:53 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Needs Feedback to Under Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/17414>

#11 - 2013-02-07 10:50 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/17414>

#12 - 2013-02-14 15:09 - Xavier Perseguers

Dmitry Dulepov wrote:

Yes, ltxmltranslate is not a part of the core but it is the official translation tool for the older versions. So we have to check. And translation server must still work properly with these changes.

No problem with the translation server. Translation server (pootle) is working with a "template" source language which is "English" for us and then can translate in other languages. English as se never appears.

We are changing the behaviour of TYPO3 starting from 4.6, so for older versions, there is no side-effect.

#13 - 2013-02-14 15:18 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch **TYPO3_6-0** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/18262>

#14 - 2013-02-14 15:20 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch **TYPO3_4-7** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/18263>

#15 - 2013-02-14 15:22 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch **TYPO3_4-6** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/18264>

#16 - 2013-02-14 15:30 - Daniel Alder

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*
- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*

Applied in changeset commit:8df3441a757f2aa5c10348ca432bcc98f565e448.

#17 - 2013-03-04 20:16 - Gerrit Code Review

- *Status changed from Resolved to Under Review*

Patch set 1 for branch **master_new** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/18653>

#18 - 2013-03-04 21:04 - Christian Kuhn

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*