

TYPO3.Flow - Bug # 43589

Status:	Resolved	Priority:	Should have
Author:	Bastian Waidelich	Category:	MVC - Routing
Created:	2012-12-04	Assigned To:	Bastian Waidelich
Updated:	2012-12-11	Due date:	
PHP Version:	5.4		
Has patch:	No		
Complexity:			
Affected Flow version:	(any)		
Subject:	Route defaults can be omitted when creating URIs		
Description			
<p>The intended behavior is following: When generating an URI using the UriBuilder, a route only matches the specified routeValues if they are all equal to the defaults of the route. So given the following route:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1- uriPattern: 'foo'2 defaults:3 bar: 'baz' <p>(@package, @controller etc left out intentionally to keep it simple)</p> <p>following should be the case:</p> <pre>Router::resolve(array('bar' => 'baz')); // resolves to "foo" Router::resolve(array('bar' => 'xyz')); // does NOT resolve Router::resolve(array()); // does NOT resolve</pre> <p>But currently this is the behavior:</p> <pre>Router::resolve(array('bar' => 'baz')); // resolves to "foo" Router::resolve(array('bar' => 'xyz')); // does NOT resolve Router::resolve(array()); // resolves to "foo"</pre> <p>Meaning: you can omit default values (if they are not part of the uriPattern).</p> <p>This works fine in most cases, but it makes it quite hard to get everything right, because too many routes match and it's hard to comprehend.</p> <p>I already work on a fix, but it has two drawbacks I'd like to get your feedback for:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. It's a breaking change and you'll have to check all your routes after applying the fix.. <p>I did that with a quite large project and most routes still worked out of the box. Except for the pagination routes:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1- name: 'Articles with optional pagination'			

```
3 uriPattern: 'articles(/page/{--paginate.currentPage})'
4 defaults:
5 '@package': 'My.Package'
6 '@controller': 'Article'
7 '@action': 'index'
8 '--paginate':
9   currentPage: '0'
10 '@package': ""
11 '@subpackage': ""
12 '@controller': ""
13 '@action': 'index'
```

This route wouldn't resolve if `$routeValues[--paginate]['@action']` is not set to "index" from now on, so I had to create an additional route:

```
1-
2 name: 'Articles with pagination'
3 uriPattern: 'articles/page/{--paginate.currentPage}'
4 defaults:
5 '@package': 'My.Package'
6 '@controller': 'Article'
7 '@action': 'index'
8 '--paginate':
9 '@package': ""
10 '@subpackage': ""
11 '@controller': ""
12 '@action': 'index'
13
14-
15 name: 'Articles'
16 uriPattern: 'articles'
17 defaults:
18 '@package': 'My.Package'
19 '@controller': 'Article'
20 '@action': 'index'
```

2. @action can't be omitted

The other drawback is the fallback behavior of the UriBuilder:

Currently, if you don't specify `@package` the package of the current request is used. The same for `@subpackage` and `@controller` (that's why `<:link.action action="foo" />` links to the `fooAction` of the current controller).

For `@action` it's different currently: If you don't specify it, the `@action` is not set in the `$routeValues`.

Because of the current behavior a route specifying the `@action` will still resolve. With the fix that wouldn't be the case anymore..

I see two solutions:

A) Make the `actionName` argument of `UriBuilder::uriFor()` required (as well as the action arguments of `uri.action`, `link.action` and `form`).

B) Fallback to "index" (or detect the first action of the controller class) I'm adding this for completeness, but this would be quite error prone IMO..

Related issues:

related to TYPO3.Flow - Feature # 39740: Allow setting fixed values for route...	Closed	2012-08-12
related to TYPO3.Fluid - Bug # 44376: Paginate widget throws exception	Resolved	2013-01-08
duplicated by TYPO3.Flow - Bug # 43588: Route defaults can be omitted when cr...	Closed	2012-12-04

Associated revisions**Revision f17a2274 - 2012-12-11 14:02 - Bastian Waidelich**

[!!!][BUGFIX] Route defaults have to be specified when creating URIs

Currently when creating URIs one can omit route values that are defined as defaults of the route.

This is not the intended behavior though, because with a lot of routes in place this leads to the situation where it gets difficult to target a certain route.

Thus for a route to match the given route values, one should have to specify all the routing defaults exactly as they are specified by the route (except for when a route part appears in the uriPattern).

This is a breaking change if you used Router or UriBuilder to create URIs without specifying all defaults (see #43589 for details).

Besides, all Fluid ViewHelpers that use the UriBuilder now require the action argument to be specified.

Change-Id: I7e4e0e20a397839c89a107b28fa176dd62459ec1

Fixes: #43589

Releases: 1.2

Revision 4e327231 - 2012-12-18 17:03 - Bastian Waidelich

[TASK] Adjust routing documentation to recent changes

This fixes the routing examples provided with the definitive guide.

Change-Id: Idaff4388a489a435440078828c7267797e75674e

Related: #43589

Releases: master, 2.0

Revision 59dc58ef - 2012-12-18 17:34 - Bastian Waidelich

[TASK] Adjust routing documentation to recent changes

This fixes the routing examples provided with the definitive guide.

Change-Id: Idaff4388a489a435440078828c7267797e75674e

Related: #43589

Releases: master, 2.0

History**#1 - 2012-12-04 17:10 - Gerrit Code Review**

- *Status changed from Accepted to Under Review*

Patch set 1 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <http://review.typo3.org/16960>

#2 - 2012-12-11 13:21 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/16960>

#3 - 2012-12-11 14:02 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/16960>

#4 - 2012-12-11 22:44 - Karsten Dambekalns

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*

- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*