

TYPO3.Surf - Task # 50847

Status:	Needs Feedback	Priority:	Could have
Author:	Felix Oertel	Category:	
Created:	2013-08-06	Assigned To:	Felix Oertel
Updated:	2013-08-07	Due date:	
Subject:	get rid of before and after stage step foo		
Description	<p>hey,</p> <p>after the recent changes, introducing packaged deployment (which i love!), we ended up with some new, kind of weird don't-know-really-what-they-are-kind-of-substages.</p> <pre>foreach (array('before', 'tasks', 'after') as \$stageStep) {</pre> <p>i don't really get that. i loved how the tasks are fully configurable in the workflow. now i have this three substages, which are pretty much hard-wired.</p> <p>if you want to run one task after another, why not just introduce an additional stage, instead of introducing much more if() and foreach()?</p> <p>please enlighten me ... ;)</p> <p>regards, foertel</p>		

History

#1 - 2013-08-07 09:14 - Tobias Liebig

- Assigned To set to Christopher Hlubek

#2 - 2013-08-07 10:24 - Christopher Hlubek

- Status changed from New to Needs Feedback

- Assigned To changed from Christopher Hlubek to Felix Oertel

We discussed some different approaches to integrate the new tasks into the workflow (Rens, some others and me).

One was indeed a solution where we needed a lot of new stages to get tasks in between which would bloat the list of stages. So we decided to add a (pretty simple) built-in stage hook for before and after a stage which is consistent with the way you can add tasks before or after another task.

In the end this really is the same as having an explicit "before-transfer", "transfer" and "after-transfer" stage (repeated for every stage).

The idea is, that default application templates should try to add tasks before or after a named stage and the user is then in full control of the tasks inside a stage. Before that change mostly everything depended on a GitCheckoutTask which was problematic since it could not be replaced easily. And we needed a way to execute some tasks before or after the transfer is complete.

Do you have a use case which is not supported or which results in a bad solution (code-wise) after the change?

#3 - 2013-08-07 10:48 - Felix Oertel

Hey Christopher,

i think in most cases you will only need one or two dependant tasks and i think it's much nicer (code-wise), to just add one or two additional stages, instead of having iterations for each and every task.

from the code, i get a strong feeling, that there is something wrong. ;)

```
if (isset($this->tasks['stage'])) {
    foreach ($this->tasks['stage'] as $applicationName => $steps) {
        foreach ($steps as $step => $tasksByStageStep) {
            foreach ($tasksByStageStep as $stageName => $tasks) {
                $this->tasks['stage'][$applicationName][$stageName][$step] = array_filter($tasks, function($task) use ($removeTask) { return
                $task !== $removeTask; });
            }
        }
    }
}
if (isset($this->tasks['after'])) {
    foreach ($this->tasks['after'] as $applicationName => $tasksByTask) {
        foreach ($tasksByTask as $taskName => $tasks) {
            $this->tasks['after'][$applicationName][$taskName] = array_filter($tasks, function($task) use ($removeTask) { return $task !==
            $removeTask; });
        }
    }
}
if (isset($this->tasks['before'])) {
    foreach ($this->tasks['before'] as $applicationName => $tasksByTask) {
        foreach ($tasksByTask as $taskName => $tasks) {
            $this->tasks['before'][$applicationName][$taskName] = array_filter($tasks, function($task) use ($removeTask) { return $task !==
            $removeTask; });
        }
    }
}
```

#4 - 2013-08-07 23:00 - Rens Admiraal

hey Felix, can you enlighten what you think is wrong codewise? Is it just the duplication, the nesting, or? Would be nice if you could make your point a bit more explicit.

Regarding the dependant tasks: it's not just that tasks can be dependant. You could have a task that should just be done after a local packaging, and before uploading. But adding the extra dependency on execution after a specific task would be too much. Like (just an example) when you would like to send a notification that the actual upload is starting after a local packaging. Would I care that this happens after a specific task in the packaging stage, or do I just want to say "when the packaging is done, I want.... "

Besides that it's harder to maintain your list of tasks if you for example append a task to the packaging stage if you only have those tasks dependencies.