TYPO3.Fluid - Task # 8491

Status:	Needs Feedback	**Priority:**	Should have
Author:	Bastian Waidelich	**Category:**	ViewHelpers
Created:	2010-06-24	**Assigned To:**	Karsten Dambekalns
Updated:	2012-03-07	**Due date:**	
Has patch:	No		
Subject:	link.action and uri.action differ in absolute argument		

Description

In r3548 the "absolute" argument of the link.action ViewHelper has been removed with following comment:
"[~TASK][~API] Fluid (ViewHelper): The ActionViewhelper now produces only absolute URIs. The argument "absolute" is now obsolete."

I don't understand why this would make sense.. And if it does, shouldn't the uri.action ViewHelper be changed accordingly?

History

#1 - 2010-06-24 19:46 - Sebastian Kurfuerst

added Robert and Karsten as watchers, so they get notified and can comment :)

#2 - 2012-03-07 16:30 - Karsten Dambekalns

- *Subject changed from ActionLink ViewHelper only generates absolute links since r3548 to link.action and uri.action differ in absolute argument*

- *Category set to ViewHelpers*

- *Assigned To set to Karsten Dambekalns*

- *Priority changed from -- undefined -- to Should have*

- *Has patch set to No*

I just asked Robert about this and he cannot remember anything :)

I am not sure about the usefulness of relative URLs here, but I doubt the inconsistency introduced should stay as it is…

Does anyone have an opinion on this?

#3 - 2012-03-07 16:35 - Bastian Waidelich

Karsten Dambekalns wrote:

> *Does anyone have an opinion on this?*

I still have the same one as "over 1 year ago" - doesn't happen too often ;)
For URIs you usually set the absolute argument more often (in E-Mails, JavaScript, ...) but IMO this should be in sync with link.uri anyways (and for links, creating relative URIs by default makes absolute sense)

#4 - 2012-03-07 16:36 - Adrian Föder

I have an opinion to everything. :)

Well, I feel uncomfortable with only-absolute URLs at all, although I can't reason this properly. So that's only IMHO.

Definitely the behavior of both should equal; couldn't even one **extend** the other? The URL handling and their options **are** and **must be** always equal together, so maybe it's possible to let the TagViewHelper (link) extend the other one...? Btw that's maybe beyond scope, but you asked ;-)

#5 - 2012-03-07 16:47 - Adrian Föder

ah, now I understand; so, the default, usual behavior is/was to have **absolute** URLs when using URI, and relative ones when using LINK? OK, that makes sense for the reason Karsten mentioned, but I'd still like to keep the possibility to control this: sometimes for example I need to store an internal action URI to a data- attribute or even to <form action=""> we all know.

Conclusion: at least for JavaScript and AJAX tricks it's useful to have the uri.action output still relative.

#6 - 2012-03-07 17:05 - Bastian Waidelich

Ok, there was some confusion. I'll try to recap:

uri.action and link.action both used to have an argument absolute that defaults to FALSE.
That has been changed for link.action: The argument has been removed completely and links are now always absolute.
That does not make sense to me. We could change the default to be TRUE but I would vote against that too as relative links should be used by default IMO (you have to take care of the base tag and so, but that's another issue).

Re: Tag-based ViewHelper **extending** other ViewHelpers. That would be nice, but it's currently not possible because PHP only allows one parent which is "AbstractTagBasedViewHelper" for Tag-VH. But it will be possible with **mixins** (or even with **traits** in 5.4)